

Find yourself in good company

Historic Preservation Commission

AGENDA

Tuesday, August 24, 2021, 6:00 PM City Council Chambers 200 West Fifth Street Greenville, NC 27835

I. Call	to	Order
---------	----	-------

- II. Roll Call
- III. Additions/Deletions to Agenda
- IV. Approval of Meeting Minutes
 - 1. July 27, 2021
- V. New Business
 - 1. Major Work COA

2021-0032:	510 W. Fourth Street
Applicant:	Rev. Michael Butler
Project:	Add a picket fence to the backyard

- 2. Minor Work COA
- 2021-0031: 1301 Johnston Street Allison Faulkner Remove storm door
- 2021-0033: 400 S. Eastern Street Robert Montaquila Reroof with like color and style shingles
- 3. Required training needs CLG update
- 4. Staff report Code Enforcement
- 5. Request for Proposals (RFP) staff update
- 6. Topics for subcommittees
- VI. Public Comment Period Refer to page 3 of agenda for public comment guidelinesVII. Committee Reports
 - 1. Design Review Committee Met to discuss COA 2021-0032
 - 2. Publicity Committee Did not meet
 - 3. Selection Committee Did not meet
- VIII. Approved COA/MWCOA Staff Update

- IX. Announcements / Other
- X. Adjournment

Public Comment Period Guidelines

- 1. An individual wishing to address the Commission during the Public Comment Period shall register with the Secretary of the Commission <u>prior to the opening of</u> <u>the meeting</u> by signing his or her name, address and short description of his or her topic on a sign-up sheet provided by the Secretary to the Commission.
- 2. The Public Comment Period shall not exceed a total of thirty minutes, unless the Commission, by majority vote, extends this limit.
- 3. Each individual will be allowed no more than three minutes for comments, unless the Commission, by a majority vote, extends this time.
- 4. Any item which is the subject of a public hearing conducted at the same meeting shall not be discussed during the Public Comment Period.
- 5. If the thirty minutes allocated to the Public Comment Period has not expired after the individuals who have registered have spoken, individuals who have failed to register before the meeting may speak during this comment period and will speak following those who have registered in advance. If time remains the Chair will ask if any other individuals desire to address the Commission during this comment period. An individual wishing to speak shall raise his or her hand to ask to be recognized by the Chair. After being recognized by the Chair, the individual shall state his or her name, address and the topic to be addressed. If permitted to speak, the individual shall limit his or her comments to the same three minutes limit.
- 6. The Chair shall act as official timekeeper. When an individual has thirty seconds left in their time to speak, the Chair will state "Thirty Seconds." The individual will need to bring their comments to a close. When time expires, the Chair will announce "Time Up." At that point, the individual must stop talking and return to their seat or leave the meeting room. No additional comments will be permitted or accepted once time has expired.
- 7. No action will be taken on matters raised during the Public Comment Period. If matters discussed require action by the Commission, the Chair will request staff to review and provide a recommendation at the next meeting.

III. Approval of Meeting Minutes

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE GREENVILLE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

July 27, 2021

The Greenville Historic Preservation Commission met on the above date at 6:00 pm via Zoom.

Jeremy Jordan - Chairperson - *

Candace Pearce – Vice chair - *	Kerry Carlin - *
Myron Caspar – *	Israel Mueller -*
Andrew Morehead - X	Scott Wells - *
Justin Edwards - X	Robert Wright - *

The members present are denoted by an "*" and the members absent are denoted by an "X".

PLANNING STAFF: Thomas Barnett, Director of Planning and Development Services; Chantae Gooby, Chief Planner; Tony Parker, Planner I; Taylor Bland, Staff Support Specialist II

OTHERS PRESENT: Donald Phillips, Assistant City Attorney; Kelvin Thomas, Communications Specialist

Motion made by Ms. Pearce, seconded by Ms. Wells, to accept the agenda as written. Motion passed unanimously.

MINUTES:

Motion made by Ms. Pearce, seconded by Dr. Carlin, to accept the May 25, 2021 minutes. Motion passed unanimously.

City Attorney Donald Phillips read the following statement:

Pursuant to North Carolina General Statute 160A-388 and Section 4, H. of the Historic Preservation Commission's Rules of Procedure:

H. <u>Conflict of Interest</u>. No member of the Historic Preservation Commission shall participate in either the discussion or vote on any certificate of appropriateness in any manner that would violate the affected persons' constitutional right to a fair and impartial decision maker. Prohibited conflicts include but are not limited to a member having a fixed opinion prior to hearing the matter and not willing to consider changing his or her mind; <u>undisclosed ex parte</u> communications with the person before the Commission, any witnesses, staff or other Commission members; a close familial, business or other associational relationship with the affected person; or a financial interest in the outcome of the matter before the board. On any other matter before the Commission where such decision by the Commission shall be in an advisory capacity only, no member shall participate in the discussion or vote on such advisory matters where the outcome on the matter being considered is reasonably likely to have a direct, substantial, and readily identifiable financial impact on the member. Decisions on either a request for recusal by a member or objections by a person appearing before the board shall be decided by a simple majority vote. A member so disqualified will not be counted or included in the count to determine the appropriate voting majority for the issue before the Commission and will not negate a quorum of the Commission.

If a Commission member has had an <u>ex parte</u> communication that needs to be disclosed at this time.

As a reminder, as members of the Commission conversations among yourselves during the discussion periods of this meeting and your committee meetings are <u>NOT</u> ex parte communications.

Chairman Jordan swore in presenting staff member – Tony Parker.

Chairman Jordan confirmed and swore in one speaker – Nick Crabtree.

New Business

1. Major Work COA

2021-0028: 807 E 3rd Street

Applicant: Nick Crabtree

Project: Demolition of accessory structure (garage)

Mr. Parker delineated and discussed the subject property. The applicant requests to demolish a non-contributing accessory building which is a garage. The garage in question is not listed in the College View Historic District Architectural Survey. There are several cracks on the north side of the garage that have attempted to be repaired. On the back side of the garage, there is a large crack and protruding cinder blocks in the walls. Chief Building Inspector William Mills, after a site visit, stated that in his professional opinion the structure is failing and must come down. The Design Review Committee met on site and recommended the building be demolished. At their subsequent meeting they had a split vote, one for removal, one for denial of removal and the third member was absent. Staff recommends to allow the removal of the accessory structure and will follow up with the removal to make sure it has been removed properly, no debris remains, and no parking improvements of any type are made without a site plan and a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Nick Crabtree spoke in favor of the application. He stated the structure is not sound or safe. He is concerned it may cause harm to neighbors or residents of the home. He stated he will have a landscape design team work on the empty space if it is demolished.

Mr. Mueller asked if he has any intention to increase parking in the area where the garage is.

Mr. Crabtree stated no. His intention is to plant blushes around the area but he would allow vehicles to pull up in that area. There would be no permanent structure for parking.

Ms. Pearce asked if he is aware that he would need to have a COA to have a vehicle parked there, otherwise they would be parked on the grass.

Mr. Crabtree asked even though it would be the area where the garage is currently located.

Ms. Pearce stated yes even though it was a prior garage.

Chairman Jordan stated after the garage is demolished, there would be dirt in the area. The City of Greenville does not allow parking on dirt so before doing any improvement that would allow parking, he would have to have a COA.

Mr. Crabtree asked if he could put gravel there.

Ms. Pearce stated not without a COA.

Chairman Jordan stated basically if the driveway that is already there in front of the garage is not part of the demolition, you can park there but anything beyond that would have to be a part of a COA request.

Mr. Crabtree asked if that can be done during this meeting.

Ms. Pearce stated no, that would be have to be a separate application.

DOC# 1150913

Chairman Jordan stated the reason it has to be a separate application is because the board can only vote on what is already a part of the application.

Attorney Phillips stated that is correct. The issue before the commission tonight is the request to demolish the garage.

Mr. Jordan closed the public hearing.

Mr. Caspar stated it appears Mr. Crabtree would want to park more cars at the home so perhaps the board should give him to opportunity to reconsider the use of the garage. If the garage was made structurally sound it could fit two more cars.

Ms. Pearce stated the garage would have to be demolished and rebuilt. It is not possible to restore or repair the current garage.

Mr. Caspar stated if Mr. Crabtree desires to have four or five cars in that area, he could park two cars in the garage. Perhaps the board should postpone and allow him the time to think about this matter.

Chairman Jordan asked Mr. Crabtree if he would have any interest in repairing the garage knowing that he may or may not be able to park additional cars there.

Mr. Crabtree stated his initial concern is that it is not safe and at some point it would have to be taken down. He has no problem with considering an alternative in the area.

Chairman Jordan stated it is certainly an option to obtain a COA to put a garage there or improvements for parking.

Mr. Crabtree stated he would like to remove the structure and then evaluate a path to take that would be satisfactory with the commission.

Motion made by Mr. Mueller, seconded by Mr. Wright, that notice has been properly given in conformance with N.C.G.S § 166A-19.24 (Session Law 2020-3) and that all provisions applicable for remote quasi-judicial hearings, particularly subsection (f) have been followed. Motion passed 6 to 1. Vote in opposition: Caspar

Motion made by Mr. Jordan, seconded by Ms. Wells, to adopt the Findings of Fact as presented by City Staff. Motion passed 6 to 1. Vote in opposition: Caspar

Motion made by Ms. Pearce, seconded by Dr. Carlin, that the garage at issue has no special significance or value toward maintaining the character of the district and given the structural hazard associated with the garage, the period of delay is hereby waved in its entirety as allowed by 160D 949 and 9-17-17 of City Code. Motion passed 7 to 0. Mr. Caspar abstained from the vote but this was counted as an affirmative vote based on the Rules of Procedure.

Attorney Phillips explained that the Rules of Procedure for the commission states that in the event a commission member abstains from voting or has withdrawn from the meeting without being excused from a majority vote by the remaining members present, such a failure to vote shall be recorded as an affirmative vote in favor of the issue before the commission.

Mr. Jordan affirmed the COA was approved.

2. Minor Work COAs

2021-0026:	605 E Fifth Street
Applicant:	John Gill
Project:	Remove diseased Pecan Tree, replace with large canopy tree
DOC# 1150913	

2021-0027:	200 S Eastern Street
Applicant:	Susan Pearce
Project:	Repaint with staff approved colors
2021-0029:	1001 Johnston Street
Applicant:	Sarah Watking Kannay and John Kannay
Applicant.	Sarah Watkins-Kenney and John Kenney
Project:	Repaint with like colors

3. Discussion of HPC Budget and Enhanced Enforcement

Thomas Barnett, Director of Planning and Development Services shared the budget amounts for the commission. He also explained there will be enhanced code enforcement in the Historic District that focuses on the Design Guidelines and Standards.

4. Discussion of Topics for a Workshop

The commission members discussed ideas for a workshop that included discussing local landmark designation, outreach and education, as well as meeting with code enforcement officer Jennifer Peebles.

5. Discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) Training and Due Dates

Tony Parker explained to the commission that to maintain the Certified Local Government status at least two commissioners and one staff member will need to watch a minimum of three presentations or webinars and write a brief synopsis. A few benefits of being a CLG is the eligibility for monies and matching grants to continue the historic work of the city, CLG's review all new nominations to the National Register of Historic Places for properties and districts within our boundaries, and the community benefits from the expertise and knowledge of the trained commissioners.

Public Comment Period

Refer to page 5 of agenda for public comment guidelines. No Public Comments.

Committee Reports

- 1. Design Review Committee COA 2021-0028: Met on site June 29, 2021, met on July 16, 2021
- 2. Publicity Committee Did not meet
- 3. Selection Committee Did not meet

Announcements / Other

No announcements.

DOC# 1150913

Motion made by Ms. Wells, seconded by Ms. Pearce, to adjourn. Motion passed unanimously.

Meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tony Parker

Planner I

- V. New Business
- 1. Major Works



COA 2021-31: 510 W. 4th Street - Glenn-Pender-Moore House

Request: Construct a picket fence in a portion of the back yard

Applicant: Reverend Michael Butler

Location: 510 W. 4th Street

Parcel Number: 06728

Attachments:

Historic Status: Local Landmark

1. Site Photos

- 2. Supplemental Materials
- 3. Location map of property

The Commission should consider this request based upon general conformance with the Design Guidelines.

Description: The Glenn-Pender-Moore house is a well preserved and neatly detailed example of the vernacular Italianate style of the 1880's. Its distinctive window pediments, deep frieze and slender Italianate porch posts are superimposed on the traditional I-house form. This home was one off the first to be built in the subdivision platted by Harry Skinner and may be the oldest surviving house in Skinnerville and one of the oldest in Greenville.

Project Analysis: The property currently has a picket fence surrounding the front yard. The applicant wishes to construct a similar three foot high picket fence around a portion of his backyard.

From the *Design Guidelines* (shortened to include only those that apply):

<u>Chapter</u>	<u>Title</u>	Pages
4	Fences and Walls	87 - 89

- 7. If a new fence or wall is to be constructed, the design must be based on accurate documentation of a historic fence or wall, or must be a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district.
- 8. New picket fences must be substantially open in character, and painted white or a color appropriate to the color of the building.

- 9. Generally, new fences or walls should be constructed to follow property lines and not to abut existing structures.
- 10. Fences along right-of-ways shall be setback three (3) feet from the interior edge of the sidewalk or three (3) feet from the interior edge of the right-of-way, whichever is greater.
- 11. Front and side yard fences generally shall not exceed three (3) feet in height. Special exceptions may be considered for institutional properties. When measuring fence height, consider all fence elements including posts.
- 12. Rear yard fences shall not exceed six (6) feet in height and may not extend forward of the rear wall of the structure.
- 13. Elements or details must not be added to a fence or a wall in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.

Staff Findings: The fence generally follows the guidelines with regard to placement, height, and does not screen the front yard. There are no added elements or details to create a false historic appearance. The new picket fence will be open in character and painted white.

Design Review: The Design Review Committee members met on August 5, 2021 with the applicant and reviewed the COA application. The members voted to approve the request.

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE MEETING

DATE: August 5, 2021 (site Visit) COA APPLICATION: 2021-0032 - 510 W. 4th Street MEMBERS PRESENT: Jeremy Jordan Candace Pearce

STAFF PRESENT: Tony Parker

EXPLANATION OF WORK: The DRC met with the applicant, Rev. Michael Butler, on site at 510 W. 4th Street. Rev. Butler would like to fence in his backyard with a picket fence that will match the fence in the front yard.

RECOMMENDATION: X APPROVED _____ DENIED _____ REFER TO SHPO

NOTES: Candace Pearce had visited the site prior to the meeting and was caught up in traffic as the meeting was to begin. She called Jeremy Jordan, they conferred, and voted to approve the request.



North

Location Map

(COA 2021-31: 510 W. 4th St.) August 24, 2021 HPC Meeting Doc. # 1151442



510 W. 4th Street

Front Yard



Side yard and backyard view from 4th Street



Side yard view from Elizabeth Street



Backyard looking toward 4th Street

- V. New Business
- 2. Minor Works



1301 Johnston Street Remove Storm Door



400 S. Eastern Street Replace roof with like color & shingles (after the fact)

VIII. Approved COA/MWCOA Staff Update

			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
2021-16	503 E. 4th St	Minor Work	Incomplete - Repair / replace wood rot, windows, front columns, brick foundation, re-paint like color
2021-17	215 S. Library	Minor Work	Incomplete - Replace dilapidated fence in-kind and style and paint front door white
2021-20	805 Johnson Street	Minor Work	Complete - Internal gutter system repair, wood rot repaired and repainted in-kind
2021-21	605 E 5th St	Minor Work	Incomplete - Repair and repaint woodrot with like materials and colors (siding and trim around sidelight windows)
2021-26	601 E 5th Street	Minor Work	Incomplete - Remove severely damaged front tree, replace with comparable tree
2021-27	200 S EASTERN ST	Minor Work	Incomplete - Repaint with approved colors
2021-28	807 E 3rd Street	Major Work	Status Pending - Removal of accessory structure (garage)
2021-29	1001 Johnston St.	Minor Work	Incomplete - Repaint with like colors
2021-31	1301 Johnston St.	Minor Work	Complete - remove storm door
2021-32	510 W. 4th St.	Major Work	PENDING - Add fence to backyard
2021-33	400 S. Eastern St.	Minor Work	Complete - Replace roof with like color & shingles, After the Fact



805 Johnston Street Internal gutter system repair, wood rot repaired and painted with like color



1301 Johnston Street Remove Storm Door



400 S. Eastern Street Replace roof with like color & shingles (after the fact)