

2.06.18

2018 SWAC Meeting #6



Meeting Topics (review)

- 1. Extent of Service (EOS) recap
- 2. Level of Service (LOS)
- 3. Funding Sources and Revenue Options
- 4. Structural BMP's
- 5. Stormwater/Watershed Planning
- 6. Water Quality Compliance
- 7. Floodplain Management
- 8. Regulatory Reforms/Ordinances



Extent of Service (recap)

- Extent of Service (Where/What)
 - Geographical Boundaries (City Limits, ETJ and beyond)
 - Public vs Private Property
 - Components of System
 - Streams, pipes, lakes, dams, stormwater control measures (SCM's/BMP's)



Recap of Extent of Service decisions

- Will consider drainage assistance outside of City Limits on a case-by-case basis when there is a demonstrated benefit to the City
- Will "maintain" drainage systems provided conveys runoff from public property
- The City will not maintain stormwater control measures (SCM's/BMP's)
- Funding for leaf collection will remain under the Sanitation Division



Level of Service



Level of Service

- Type and magnitude of benefits derived from the City's Stormwater Program
- Can be used to evaluate the performance of stormwater programs
 - Is the program inadequate, adequate or should the level of service be increased?
- For discussion, stormwater programs can be generalized or broken down into individual components



General Categories

- <u>Program Management</u> Administration & regulatory responsibilities
- <u>Operation and Maintenance</u> Day to day maintenance of the drainage system
- <u>Capital Improvement</u> Large investments in drainage improvements



Program Management

- Typical activities can include
 - Administration (budget, personnel, billing, audit)
 - New development plan review, inspection, enforcement
 - Strategic Planning (watershed or neighborhood studies)
 - Water Quality Compliance (federal and NC rules)
 - Floodplain regulation
 - Citizen complaint / information request response
 - Asset management / inventory



Program Management

- Proactive vs. Reactive Management
- Upfront investment may save on Capital Expenditures (CIP)
 - Construction inspection to ensure correct design and installation
 - Floodplain regulation to keep improvements out of harm's way
 - Asset management to identify needs



Operation and Maintenance

- Typical activities can include
 - Open System (streams/ditches) Remove nuisance vegetation, debris, sediment that can impede flow
 - Closed System Clean catch basins & flush pipes
 - Minor repairs to catch basins and pipes
 - Street sweeping
 - Maintaining <u>City owned</u> stormwater controls (BMP's)
 - Private drainage system assistance (when conveys runoff from public property)



Operation & Maintenance

- Proactive vs. reactive maintenance
- Upfront costs associated with proactive maintenance staff and equipment
- Proactive maintenance provides long term cost savings
 - Reduction in damages during storm events
 - Rehabilitation and maintenance costs typically less than replacement when fails – can be planned



Evaluating Level of Service

- To facilitate evaluation and consideration of alternative levels of service, a letter grading system is suggested
 - "A" thru "E"
 - For each program component, the stakeholder group may determine the current level & consider if a higher or lower level is desired



| Level of Service "Grades" for General Program Categories | | | | | | |
|--|---|--------------------------------------|---------------------------|--|--|--|
| | | General Program Categories | | | | |
| Level of Service | Program Management & Regulatory | | | | | |
| "Grade" | Compliance | Operation & Maintenance | Capital Improvement (CIP) | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | comprehensive program planning, | | | | | |
| | aggressive state and federal regulatory | | | | | |
| А | compliance that exceeds minimum | | | | | |
| ~ | requirements in all cases, state of the | fully preventative and proactive | | | | |
| | art practices, full program | maintenance, state of the art | all known CIP needs | | | |
| | implementation | practices | completed in 10 years | | | |
| | basin master planning, above average | | | | | |
| | state and federal regulatory | | | | | |
| В | compliance that exceeds minimum | | | | | |
| | requirements in most cases, | fully routine & partially inspection | all known CIP needs | | | |
| | systematic program implementation | based maintenance | completed in 20 years | | | |
| | limited planning, average state and | | | | | |
| | federal regulatory compliance that | | | | | |
| С | exceeds minimum requirements in | limited routine maintenance, limited | | | | |
| | some cases, priority program | inspection based maintenance, | all known CIP needs | | | |
| | implementation | partially reactive maintenance | completed in 30 years | | | |
| | minimal planning, minimum required | no routine or inspection based | | | | |
| D | state and federal compliance, partial | maintenance, reactive maintenance | all known CIP needs | | | |
| | program implementation | only | completed in 40 years | | | |
| | no planning, minimum required state | | | | | |
| E | and federal compliance, minimal | | all known CIP needs | | | |
| | program implementation | limited reactive maintenance | completed in 50+ years | | | |



| | current level of | promised level | desired level of |
|---|------------------|----------------|------------------|
| Program Management | service | of service | service per SWAC |
| Administration/management | | | |
| Billing/finance/auditing | | | |
| Stormwater complaint/information request response | | | |
| Planning (strategic and master planning) | | | |
| Floodplain regulation | | | |
| Design | | | |
| Construction project management | | | |
| Water quality/NPDES compliance | | | |
| Illicit discharge detection, elimination, and enforcement | | | |
| Construction and post-construction inspection/enforcement | | | |
| Asset management/system inventory | | | |



| | current level of | promised level | desired level of |
|--|------------------|----------------|------------------|
| Annual Operations and Maintenance | service | of service | service per SWAC |
| Inlet/manhole (closed system) inspection, cleaning and minor repairs | | | |
| Pipe (closed system) inspection, cleaning, and minor repairs | | | |
| Roadway culvert (open system) inspection, cleaning and minor repairs | | | |
| Bridge (open system) inspection and minor repairs | | | |
| Ditch (open system) inspection and cleaning | | | |
| Public dam inspection and minor repairs | | | |
| Public BMP inspection and minor repairs | | | |
| Stream inspection and clearing | | | |
| Street sweeping/litter control | | | |
| Private drainage assistance | | | |



| | current level of | promised level of | desired level of |
|--|------------------|-------------------|------------------|
| Capital Improvement Program (CIP) | service | service | service per SWAC |
| | | | |
| Engineering & construction for replacement of aging and failing pipe systems | | | |
| Engineering & construction for increasing capacity of primary (major) open | | | |
| channel systems, pipe systems, and culverts under roadways | | | |
| Engineering & construction for increasing capacity of secondary neighborhood | | | |
| pipe systems and ditches | | | |
| Engineering and new construction of water quality retrofits | | | |
| Restoration and stabilization of eroding streams | | | |



Evaluating Level of Service

- Review of responses
 - Comparison of SWAC & Staff



| | CURRENT | | PROM | PROMISED | | DESIRED | |
|---|---------|-------|------|----------|------|---------|--|
| | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff | |
| Program Management | | | | | | | |
| Administration / management | C+ | B- | В- | B- | B+ | B+ | |
| Billing / finance / auditing | C+ | D | C+ | B- | В | B+ | |
| Stormwater complaint / information request | | | | | | | |
| response | С | C+ | В | В | В | A- | |
| Planning (strategic and master planning) | C+ | B- | В- | B- | В | A- | |
| Floodplain regulation | C+ | C+ | B- | В | В | B+ | |
| Design | В- | С | В | C+ | В | B- | |
| Construction project management | C+ | C+ | B- | C+ | В | B- | |
| Water quality / NPDES compliance | C+ | C- | В | C+ | В | B+ | |
| Illicit discharge elimination / violation | | | | | | | |
| enforcement | C+ | D+ | В- | С | В | B+ | |
| Construction and post-construction inspection | | | | | | | |
| / enforcement | В- | D | B- | С | В | A- | |
| Asset management / system inventory | C+ | D+ | В- | С | В | B+ | |
| Average for all Program Mang | C+ | С | В- | C+ | В | B+ | |



| | CURRENT | | PRON | /IISED | DESIRED | |
|--|---------|-------|------|---------------|---------|-------|
| | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff |
| Annual Operations and | | | | | | |
| Maintenance | | | | | | |
| Inlet / manhole (closed system) inspection, | | | | | | |
| cleaning and minor repairs | В- | C+ | B- | C+ | В | В |
| Pipe (closed system) inspection, cleaning, and | | | | | | |
| minor repairs | C+ | C+ | B- | C+ | В | В |
| Roadway culvert (open system) inspection, | | | | | | |
| cleaning and minor repairs | С | B- | B- | B- | B- | B+ |
| Bridge (open system) inspection and minor | | | | | | |
| repairs | С | B- | B- | B- | В | B+ |
| Ditch (open system) inspection and cleaning | C- | В | B- | В | В | B+ |
| Public dam inspection and minor repairs | С | C- | C+ | С | B- | C+ |
| Public BMP inspection and minor repairs | В- | D- | B- | B- | В | В |
| Stream inspection and clearing | C- | B- | C+ | В | В | В |
| Street sweeping/litter control | В | В | В | В | В | В |
| Private drainage assistance | C- | E+ | C- | D | C+ | D- |
| Average for all O&M | С | С | C+ | C+ | В | В |



| | CURRENT | | PRON | /IISED | DES | IRED |
|---|---------|-------|------|---------------|------|-------|
| | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff | SWAC | Staff |
| Capital Improvement Program (CIP) | | | | | | |
| Engineering & construction for replacement of aging and failing pipe systems | В- | D+ | В | C- | B+ | C+ |
| Engineering & construction for increasing capacity of primary open channel systems and culverts | С | E | С | D- | В | С |
| Engineering & construction for increasing capacity of secondary neighborhood pipe systems and ditches | C- | E+ | В- | D- | В | С |
| Engineering and new construction of water quality retrofits | С | E | B+ | D- | В- | С |
| Restoration and stabilization of eroding streams | C- | С | B- | С | В | В |
| Average for all CIP | С | D- | В | D | В | C+ |



Greenville CIP Needs

Total Capital Imp. Costs

- Flood Control Primary
- Flood Control Secondary
- Streambank Stabilization
- Water Quality

\$ 80-95M \$ 40M \$ 12.5M \$ 20.5M

\$ 150-170M



LOS CIP Funding

 A
 10 years
 \$17 M/yr

 B
 20 years
 \$8.5 M/yr

 C
 30 years
 \$5.7 M/yr

 D
 40 years
 \$4.3 M/yr

 E
 50 years
 \$3.4 M/yr

Current annual revenue = \$6.3 M/yr 34% allocated to CIP = \$2.1 M/yr



| | Program Management & Regulatory Compliance | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Level of Service "Grade" | Current | Promised | Desired | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| A | comprehensive program planning, aggressive state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in all cases, state of the art practices, full program implementation | comprehensive program planning, aggressive state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in all cases, state of the art practices, full program implementation | comprehensive program planning, aggressive state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in all cases, state of the art practices, full program implementation | | | |
| В | basin master planning, above average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in most cases, systematic program implementation | basin master planning, above average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in most cases, systematic program implementation | basin master planning, above average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in most cases, systematic program implementation | | | |
| с | limited planning, average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in some cases, priority program implementation | limited planning, average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in some cases, priority program implementation | limited planning, average state and federal regulatory compliance that exceeds minimum requirements in some cases, priority program implementation | | | |
| D | minimal planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, partial program implementation | minimal planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, partial program implementation | minimal planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, partial program implementation | | | |
| E | no planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, minimal program implementation | no planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, minimal program implementation | no planning, minimum required state and federal compliance, minimal program implementation | | | |
| | SWAC ranking | | | | | |
| | Staff ranking | | | | | |
| | Same ranking | | | | | |



| | Annual Operations and Maintenance | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Level of Service "Grade" | Current | Promised | Desired | | | |
| А | | fully preventative and proactive maintenance , state of the art practices | fully preventative and proactive maintenance, state of the art practices | | | |
| В | fully routine & partially inspection based maintenance | fully routine & partially inspection based maintenance | fully routine & partially inspection based maintenance | | | |
| с | limited routine maintenance, limited inspection based maintenance, partially reactive maintenance | limited routine maintenance, limited inspection based maintenance, partially reactive maintenance | limited routine maintenance, limited inspection based maintenance, partially reactive maintenance | | | |
| D | no routine or inspection based maintenance, reactive maintenance only | no routine or inspection based maintenance, reactive maintenance only | no routine or inspection based maintenance, reactive maintenance only | | | |
| E | limited reactive maintenance | limited reactive maintenance | limited reactive maintenance | | | |
| | SWAC ranking | | | | | |
| | Staff ranking | | | | | |
| | Same ranking | | | | | |



| | Capital Improvement (CIP) | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Level of Service "Grade" | Current | Promised | Desired | | | |
| Α | all known CIP needs completed in 10 years | all known CIP needs completed in 10 years | all known CIP needs completed in 10 years | | | |
| В | all known CIP needs completed in 20 years | all known CIP needs completed in 20 years | all known CIP needs completed in 20 years | | | |
| С | all known CIP needs completed in 30 years | all known CIP needs completed in 30 years | all known CIP needs completed in 30 years | | | |
| D | all known CIP needs completed in 40 years | all known CIP needs completed in 40 years | all known CIP needs completed in 40 years | | | |
| E | all known CIP needs completed in 50+ years | all known CIP needs completed in 50+ years | all known CIP needs completed in 50+ years | | | |
| | SWAC ranking | | | | | |
| | Staff ranking | | | | | |
| | Same ranking | | | | | |



Evaluating Level of Service

Consensus on Desired LOS



Questions and/or Comments